MODIFIED CALTRANS QUANTITATIVE
PROJECT DELIVERY METHOD SELECTION
SCORING SUMMARY, RECOMMENDATION, AND COMMENTS

Project Name				
Date				
Review Panel Members Name and Project Role				
Project Delivery Selection Scoring Summary		Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
Project Scope and Characteristic Evaluation Score (Worksheet 1)				
Project Success Criteria Evaluation Score (Worksheet 2)				
Total Score				
Project Delivery Method Selection Recommendation		☐ Design-Bid-Build	☐ CMGC or CMAR	☐ Progressive Design-Build
Comments:				

Note: This Project Delivery Method Recommendation Summary and Evaluation Worksheets are adapted from the Caltrans *Alternative Procurement Guide* dated April 2008, with modifications to address the project delivery requirements.

Project Delivery Method Selection – Quantitative Assessment Framework

This document provides a quantitative assessment framework delivering the Project. Page 1 provides the scoring summary, delivery method recommendation, and comments. Worksheets 1 and 2 provide the quantitative framework for assessing the Project scope and characteristics and success criteria for the potential project delivery methods.

It is recommended that the quantitative assessment be completed through a collaborative process of Caltrain and key stakeholder staff to discuss the Project characteristics to enable a uniform understanding of the Project requirements and subsequent scoring. The group should complete Page 1 with the initial Project summary information. The next step involves individually evaluating each project delivery method's ability to meet the criteria noted. Check the box in the criteria column which best represents the response relative to the Project. Note the point score corresponding to the checked box at the top of each project delivery method. Continue to the end of each Worksheet. Total the score for each Worksheet and transfer the Worksheet scores to Page 1 to determine the total project delivery method score. The highest total point score indicates the project delivery method most appropriate for the Project.

The N/A score in the Project Scope and Characteristics Criteria Questions 1a)-A and 1b)-A and in Project Success Criteria Questions 2e)-3-C and 2e)-4-C indicates the project delivery method is not applicable to the Project and further scoring for this delivery method should not be completed.

WORKSHEET 1 – PROJECT SCOPE AND CHARACTERISTIC CRITERIA EVALUATION

Project Scope and Characteristic Criteria	Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
1a) Where is the project in the project development process?	*1a)* _____	*1a)* _____	*1a)* _____
☐ A. Detailed final engineering stage completed	A.10 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. Preliminary design in process	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Conceptual engineering stage completed	C. 0 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts
1b) What is the size and complexity of the project?	*1b)* _____	*1b)* _____	*1b)* _____
☐ A. Relatively simple, smaller project with no need for specialized outside expertise	A. 10 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. Medium size project with more technically complex components and schedule complexity	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Large, complex project with significant schedule complexity (e.g., multiple phases, extensive third-party issues, specialized expertise needed)	C. 0 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts
1c) Does the project involve significant impacts to Caltrain operations, tenants, users, and the local business and community during construction?	*1c)* _____	*1c)* _____	*1c)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 10 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 5 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts

Project Scope and Characteristic Criteria	Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
1d) Does the project present right-of-way limitations that would benefit from the construction manager's assistance?	*1d)* _____	*1d)* _____	*1d)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A.10 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts
1e) Does the project present environmental permitting issues that would benefit from the construction manager's assistance?	*1e)* _____	*1e)* _____	*1e)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
1f) Does the project present utility or third-party issues that would benefit from the construction manager's assistance?	*1f)* _____	*1f)* _____	*1f)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 10 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts
1g) Does the project present unique work restrictions or Caltrain operation and maintenance requirements that would benefit from the construction manager's assistance?	*1g)* _____	*1g)* _____	*1g)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
1h) Would the project benefit by packaging features of work to allow early lock-in of construction material and labor pricing?	*1h)* _____	*1h)* _____	*1h)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts
1i) Would the project benefit by raising quality standards and benchmarks to minimize maintenance and achieve lower life-cycle cost?	*1i)* _____	*1i)* _____	*1i)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts	C. 10 pts
Project Scope and Characteristic Criteria Subtotal (Total of questions 1a) to 1i) scores	*Score* _____	*Score* _____	*Score* _____

WORKSHEET 2 – PROJECT SUCCESS CRITERIA EVALUATION

Project Success Criteria	Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
2a) Schedule Issues			
1. Can time-savings be realized through concurrent design and construction activities such as fast-tracking?	*2a-1)* _____	*2a-1)* _____	*2a-1)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 4 pts	B. 4 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 7 pts	C. 7 pts
2. Can the schedule be compressed?	*2a-2)* _____	*2a-2)* _____	*2a-2)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 4 pts	B. 4 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 7 pts	C. 7 pts
2b) Opportunity for Innovation?			
1. Will the project scope allow for innovation including alternate designs, Caltrain focused management, and preferred construction means and methods?	*2b-1)* _____	*2b-1)* _____	*2b-1)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 3 pts	B. 3 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
2. Must the project scope be primarily defined in terms of prescriptive specifications such as predetermined materials and methods, or can performance specifications expressing desired end results be used, or a combination of both techniques?	*2b-2)* _____	*2b-2)* _____	*2b-2)* _____
☐ A. Primarily prescriptive specifications	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. Combination of prescriptive and performance specifications	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Performance specifications for significant elements	C. 0 pts	C. 2 pts	C. 5 pts
2c) Quality Enhancement			
1. Will there be opportunities for contractors to provide materials or methods that provide greater value than normally specified by Caltrain on similar projects?	*2c-1)* _____	*2c-1)* _____	*2c-1)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts

Project Success Criteria	Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
2. Will there be the opportunity for realization of greater value due to designs tailored to contractor's area of expertise?	*2c-2)* _____	*2c-2)* _____	*2c-2)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
3. Will warranties or maintenance agreements be used?	*2c-3)* _____	*2c-3)* _____	*2c-3)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. Limited to short-term workmanship and materials	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
4. The Project benefits from close collaboration between designer and the contractor during final design.	*2c-4)* _____	*2c-4)* _____	*2c-4)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 5 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
5. The Project benefits from a delivery team voluntarily assembled by the designer and contractor.	*2c-5)* _____	*2c-5)* _____	*2c-5)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 2 pts	B. 2 pts	B. 3 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 2 pts	C. 2 pts	C. 5 pts
2d) Cost issues			
1. Will there be opportunities for contractors to provide designs with lower initial construction costs than those typically specified by Caltrain?	*2d-1)* _____	*2d-1)* _____	*2d-1)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 3 pts	B. 3 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
2. Will there be opportunities for contractors and subcontractors to provide alternate design concepts with lower lifecycle costs than those typically specified by Caltrain?	*2d-2)* _____	*2d-2)* _____	*2d-2)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. More than typical	B. 0 pts	B. 3 pts	B. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts

Project Success Criteria	Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
3. Is funding for the Project committed and available?	*2d-3)* _____	*2d-3)* _____	*2d-3)* _____
☐ A. Secured for design phase only or cannot support accelerated construction	A. 5 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. Funding can accommodate fast-tracking to some extent	B. 0 pts	B. 2 pts	B. 2 pts
☐ C. Funding will accommodate compressed schedule and fast-tracking	C. 0 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts
4. Will the cost of procurement affect the number of bidders?	*2d-4)* _____	*2d-4)* _____	*2d-4)* _____
☐ A. Procurement cost could significantly limit competition	A. 5 pts	A. 3 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. Procurement cost could affect the number of bidders	B. 5 pts	B. 4 pts	B. 3 pts
☐ C. Procurement cost would not be a significant issue given the size or complexity of the project	C. 7 pts	C. 7 pts	C. 5 pts
5. Will project budget control benefit from the use of formal contingencies?	*2d-5)* _____	*2d-5)* _____	*2d-5)* _____
☐ A. No benefit	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 5 pts
☐ B. A formal contingency may permit Caltrain to add project scope or enhance quality within the constraints of its published budget	B. 2 pts	B. 2 pts	B. 0 pts
☐ C. A formal contingency is required to allow Caltrain to maximize project scope and quality within the constraints of its published budget	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 0 pts
6. Caltrain receives the benefit of competitive pricing to determine the Total Contract Price (TCP).	*2d-6)* _____	*2d-6)* _____	*2d-6)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. More than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 5 pts	C. 2 pts	C. 2 pts
2e) Staffing issues			
1. Does Caltrain have the expertise and resources necessary for a more complicated procurement process?	*2e-1)* _____	*2e-1)* _____	*2e-1)* _____
☐ A. Inadequate resources or expertise	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts	A. 0 pts
☐ B. Limited resources or expertise	B. 3 pts	B. 3 pts	B. 0 pts
☐ C. Adequate resources and expertise	C. 5 pts	C. 5 pts	C. 0 pts

Project Success Criteria	Design-Bid-Build	CMGC	Progressive Design-Build
2. Caltrain or Consultant staff is actively involved in the final design phase.	*2e-2)* _____	*2e-2)* _____	*2e-2)* _____
☐ A. No more than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts
☐ B. More than typical	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts
☐ C. Much more than typical	C. 5 pts	C. 7 pts	C. 7 pts
3. Are Caltrain or Consultant resources available to complete the design?	*2e-3)* _____	*2e-3)* _____	*2e-3)* _____
☐ A. Resources are available to complete design	A. 5 pts	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. Resources are available for partial design	B. 2 pts	B. 2 pts	B. 2 pts
☐ C. Specialized expertise, not available in-house, is required	C. 0 pts	C. 2 pts	C. 2 pts
4. Are Caltrain or Consultant resources available to provide construction oversight?	*2e-4)* _____	*2e-4)* _____	*2e-4)* _____
☐ A. Resources are available	A. 5 pts	A. 2 pts	A. 2 pts
☐ B. Full-time construction oversight could strain staff resources	B. 2 pts	B. 3 pts	B. 3 pts
☐ C. Resources are unavailable	C. 0 pts	C. 3 pts	C. 3 pts
Project Success Criteria Subtotal (Total questions 2a to 2e scores)	*Score* _____	*Score* _____	*Score* _____