

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (CAC)  
PENINSULA CORRIDOR JOINT POWERS BOARD (JPB)  
SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING  
Bacciocco Auditorium, 2<sup>nd</sup> Floor  
1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos CA 94070**

**MINUTES OF APRIL 16, 2014**

**MEMBERS PRESENT:** P. Bendix, J. Berk, C. Cobey, K. Gardiner, A. Levin, G. Scharff, A. Sweet, C. Tucker

**MEMBERS ABSENT:** Y. Mills

**STAFF PRESENT:** J. Averill, T. Bartholomew, M. Bouchard, C. Harvey, R. Haskin, A. Maguigad

Chair Cat Tucker called the meeting to order at 5:42 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**INTRODUCTION OF NEW CAC MEMBER GREG SCHARFF**

Greg Scharff, the new CAC member representing Santa Clara County, was introduced.

**APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

No discussion.

A motion (Cobey/Tucker) to approve the minutes of March 19, 2014 was approved (Gardiner, Sweet abstained).

**PUBLIC COMMENT**

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, said the average cost per passenger for Caltrain is \$5.10 and the average fare per passenger mile is 22 cents. He said Caltrain passengers pay more than other transit systems in the Bay Area. He said Bay Area Rapid Transit (BART) passengers pay \$3.45 per trip. He said Chicago Metra System (Metra) passengers pay \$3.78 per trip. He said the argument that Caltrain tickets are too low is not valid because there are other systems that charge much less than Caltrain. He said it would be nice if Caltrain would provide the same level of ridership detail that Metra does.

**CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT – Cat Tucker**

Chair Tucker said Art Lloyd retired from the JPB and was provided a commendation from the Board.

**PROPOSED CALTRAIN FARE ADJUSTMENT – Rita Haskin**

Rita Haskin, Executive Officer, Marketing and Development, presented:

- Proposal:
  - Parking – effective August 1, 2014. Provide the executive director with the authority to charge market-based parking fees up to \$25 at stations for special events.

- Youth Age – effective January 1, 2015. Expand the age of youth from 17 to 18 years.
- Go Pass – effective October 5, 2014. Increase cost by \$15, to \$180 per participant; set minimum level of participate from \$13,750 to \$15,120. Increase cost to \$190 per participate for 2016; set minimum level at \$15,960.
- Paper tickets – effective October 5, 2014. Increase the cost of paper one-way and Zone Upgrade tickets by 25 cents. Increase the cost of the Day Pass by 50 cents.
- A fare chart was shown.
- Timeline:
  - Public meetings – May 2014
  - Public hearing – June 5, 2014
  - Board action – July 3, 2014
  - Implementation – different for each component
- Ways to comment:
  - E-mail [changes@caltrain.com](mailto:changes@caltrain.com)
  - Mail to Caltrain, JPB Secretary, P.O. Box 3006, San Carlos, CA 94070-1306
  - Phone 800.660.4287 or TTY 650.508.6448
  - Attend public hearing on June 5, 2014
- Stay informed
  - Website: [www.caltrain.com](http://www.caltrain.com)
  - Facebook: [www.facebook.com/caltrain](http://www.facebook.com/caltrain)
  - Twitter: [@GoCaltrain](https://twitter.com/GoCaltrain)

Alex Sweet said increasing the price of parking and expanding the age of youth are great. She asked if the increase of parking is going to be demand-based pricing. Ms. Haskin said it is based on market demand depending on events in the area and what those venues are charging.

Ms. Sweet asked how staff concluded \$180 as the proper price for the Go Pass and asked if there are concerns about participation declining. Ms. Haskin said some businesses may think it is not in their best interest to participate. She said the price hasn't been raised in quite some time so it was a logical move to go to \$180. She said Caltrain received more money from businesses before they joined Go Pass than after, so staff is trying to keep the program close to revenue neutral.

Jonathan Berk said clearly Caltrain charges too little because there is no space on the train. He said if the train is at capacity, more could be charged for the tickets. He said maximizing revenue is not necessarily the goal of a public agency. He said he would like to see more of an analysis of what is in the public good when the fares are set. He said if Caltrain charged more, total revenue would go up, but congestion on the highways would increase. He said there are models that show what the best situation is for the public good, but he does not see that information in these presentations.

Mr. Scharff said he wants to get as many people as possible to ride Caltrain given the capacity and as many trains as possible. He said he would like to know what the capacity is and see if it is possible to charge different fares at different times to

maximize ridership. Ms. Haskin said charging different fares at different times of the day is a flexibility staff would like to have built into the new Clipper system. She said currently the infrastructure is not there and cannot be put there; the system is not smart enough.

Mr. Scharff said he is concerned about driving people away from the Go Pass with the fare change. He said it would be great to have backup information with some understanding how everything works. He said he can't address other constraints without more information.

Chris Cobey asked when staff will release additional reports as information is collected. Ms. Haskin said staff puts out information to the Board about a week in advance of the Board meeting and when the public hearing ends on June 5, staff will pull all the data and comments together to determine what needs adjustment. Staff is also conducting a Title VI analysis to ensure the changes won't have a disproportionate impact or burden on low-income or minority customers. She said as part of the process to the Board, the Board gets a copy of all the comments received and a summary sheet stating how many people are in support of the changes. This data will be available online.

Kevin Gardiner asked if the \$25 parking program is just for stations near Levi's Stadium. Ms. Haskin said it could be at any station so it could be applied as needed.

Adina Levin said from what she heard the Go Pass is a good deal for the companies that participate and it will still be a good deal at the new price. She said it is a better way to increase prices than through the everyday ticket price. She said in the future it would be to use the Go Pass for neighborhoods or transportation management associations that support companies with a small amount of employees.

Ms. Levin asked why it can't be possible to use a Day Pass on Clipper. Ms. Haskin said Caltrain has multiple zones and the Clipper system cannot look at how those zones are configured, and it considers all the rides as one-way trips.

Mr. Berk said he is concerned about people who park at a Caltrain lot who want to take Caltrain, not attend a local event, and then that person would have to pay the market price to park at the Caltrain lot. Ms. Haskin said there are people who would take advantage of that and tell the lot attendant they are taking Caltrain so they could pay the standard parking fee and then would actually attend the event. She said Caltrain will have to educate the customers and let them know which parking lots to park at in order to pay the standard parking fee.

#### **STAFF REPORT – Michelle Bouchard**

Chuck Harvey, Deputy CEO, said the Quint Street Bridge in San Francisco is in a condition that required staff to issue a slow order on northbound tracks. He said staff and a third party engineering bridge expert firm completed an assessment and have developed a repair. A purchase order will be issued by April 18. An emergency procurement method was authorized by the Board, is legal and will be used to allow staff to source and locate experts to do the work. The repair work will cost about \$50,000 out of capital contingency money. Mr. Harvey said after the repair the trains

will still not be allowed to travel at maximum speed over the bridge, but they will move fast enough to minimize issues regarding adherence to the existing schedule. He said the bridge is aging and near the end of its useful life. He said the repairs are appropriate and the bridge is safe to operate on. He said staff is working with the city of San Francisco and the San Francisco County Transportation Authority to approve the bridge replacement project that has been tied up with the politics of the local community. He said Quint Street will be closed and a permanent berm will be placed. That will not preclude San Francisco's ability to build an Oakdale Station, which is in their long-range plans. He said he hopes to have the repair completed in the next two or three weeks.

Michelle Bouchard, Director, Rail Transportation, reported:

- The new San Bruno Station opened on April 1.
- March ridership is over 53,000 riders, 9 percent over previous year.
- The typical ridership counts are expected for special trains during baseball season.
- Special service will be provided after the Sharks game on Sunday. Typically, Caltrain ends service at 9 p.m., but this time a train will wait to depart 15 minutes after the end of the game.
- Staff is continuing future planning for Levi's stadium. Staff has been working with Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority (VTA). This will have a massive system-wide impact for VTA. The soft launch is on August 2 for the Earthquakes soccer game.

### **Annual Passenger Counts**

Ms. Bouchard reported:

- The purpose of annual ridership counts is to provide a measurement relative to previous years.
- Counts were done on every weekday train and were averaged over five weekdays; one weekend train was counted.
- Average weekday ridership was 52,611, an 11.8 percent over 2013.
- Traditional peak in morning and southbound in afternoon increased 14.1 percent.
- Midday ridership increased 8.5 percent.
- Twenty-eight of the 29 stations had increased weekday ridership over 2013.
- All counties saw significant increase in ridership.
- Gilroy extension ridership increased 9.7 percent over 2013.
- Baby Bullet trains continue to be very popular, but ridership on limited trains increased the most.
- Top northbound trains are 319, 323, 329, 375, 217, 225, 233, and 313. Top southbound trains are 376, 370, 366, 268, 278, 324, and 322.
- The last service change was in October 2012. At that time four shoulder peak trains were added and ridership increased 22 percent. A fifth train was added in the afternoon peak and had a 33 percent increase. Six stops were added to traditional commute limited-stop trains at Sunnyvale and a 16 percent increase resulted at those stops; six stops were added at Palo Alto to reverse Baby Bullet trains and a 10 percent increase resulted.
- Average weekday trip length is 22.6 miles.

- Average weekday bike ridership is 5,874, an increase of 19.6 percent.
- Top five bicycle boarding stations are San Francisco, Palo Alto, Mountain View, San Jose Diridon, and Redwood City.
- Overall, 50 bikes were denied boarding during the survey out of 29,370 bikes carried.
- Bike denials were on Trains 324, 366, 215, 323, 225, 375, and 277.
- Weekend service increased 1 percent.
- Weekend bullet service is still a success.
- Next steps include:
  - Investigate opportunities in the shoulder peak to increase service.
  - Fiscal Year (FY) 2015 Operating and Capital budgets must support the required resources to meet demand.
  - Increasing capacity between FY2015 and FY2020 is essential to continue ridership and revenue growth.
  - Future service planning requires use of ridership data to develop potential scenarios to improve capacity pre/post electrification.

Ms. Sweet asked how each county's cost share is determined. Ms. Bouchard said the data in the county by county comparison will be part of the consideration for future discussions. This year Caltrain has a balanced budget. She said over the last 10 years, San Mateo's share of the ridership has been shrinking and ridership at each end has been increasing. Mr. Harvey said last year the partners agreed to open up the morning formula allocation of costs, and this year's allocation is a more equitable distribution. He said Santa Clara and San Francisco counties are paying proportionality a higher percentage of the Caltrain Operating Budget.

Mr. Berk said the trains are basically at capacity now. He said budget is surplus because of higher ridership. In order to keep growing, the system has to add capacity and that will cost money. He said these surpluses can't continue if Caltrain can't add more service. Ms. Bouchard said staff is wondering when the demand will flatten out. She said it is not as simple as adding more cars to the fleet; that takes time.

Mr. Scharff said there is still capacity going from San Francisco into the South Bay. He asked if fares are charged differently for going south. Ms. Bouchard said no. Mr. Scharff asked if that is something to think about. Ms. Bouchard said there are things that could raise awareness, such as marketing and schedule solutions. She said there is desire to provide fast service for some people and a need to provide coverage for others.

Mr. Scharff asked if most employer Go Pass users originate their trips out of San Francisco. Ms. Haskin said staff will look into it, but most of the employers who buy Go Passes are in the South Bay and many of their employees live in the South Bay.

Mr. Harvey said Silicon Valley companies have growth plans where they are and they do not want to relocate. If some of the companies decide to mode shift off of their dedicated buses and use the Go Pass, they could overwhelm the southbound commute. He said there isn't a problem with not using capacity going south, the problem is Caltrain is about to get overwhelmed.

Mr. Scharff said Redwood City is building 10,000 apartments and that will change the train station and could change ridership at that station. Ms. Bouchard said San Carlos and Hillsdale have transit-oriented development (TOD) plans. She said the system is very constrained and can't put in a huge parking garage, so Caltrain relies on TOD to evolve the way people use the train.

Mr. Scharff asked if staff is conducting growth projections.

Paul Bendix left at 7:08 p.m.

Ms. Bouchard said the longer-term projections have been related to the Environmental Impact Report for electrification. They show growth in the 70,000 range.

Ms. Levin asked when the real-time information will be working again. Ms. Bouchard said it has had some problems but a fix is coming in two weeks and will be tested and then rolled out.

Ms. Bouchard said this will be her last CAC meeting because she is leaving Caltrain and April Maguigad, Manager, Rail Operations, will be the staff liaison to the CAC. Chair Tucker said farewell and presented flowers to Ms. Bouchard.

### **Committee Comments**

Mr. Berk asked why Caltrain trains are labeled with a number that can't be seen. He said he is wondering if it could be made simpler with color codes red, yellow, and white.

Mr. Cobey said April 23 is customer Appreciation Day and asked what is happening. Ms. Haskin said it is a wrap up of the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary and staff will go to both ends of the line thanking customers and handing out giveaway bags.

Mr. Cobey asked how much it would cost to send another train after the last out at a baseball game. Ms. Bouchard said there is a cost in bodies, fuel, hours of service issues, maintenance time, and other issues.

Mr. Cobey asked if the special train that leaves after a baseball game ends is usually at capacity. Mr. Harvey said it depends on the game. Ms. Haskin said a third special train was ready to be used after the last Giants/Dodgers game because staff anticipated a large crowd.

Ms. Levin said Friends of Caltrain met a few weeks ago to learn about steps for getting dedicated funding for Caltrain, plans around the Downtown Extension and the rail yards, and bicycle and pedestrian station access.

### **DATE, TIME AND LOCATION OF NEXT MEETING:**

May 21, 2014 at 5:40 p.m., San Mateo County Transit District Administrative Building, 2nd Floor Bacciocco Auditorium, 1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos, CA.

Meeting adjourned at 7:16 p.m.