

**CITIZENS ADVISORY COMMITTEE (CAC)
PENINSULA CORRIDOR JOINT POWERS BOARD (JPB)
SAN MATEO COUNTY TRANSIT DISTRICT ADMINISTRATIVE BUILDING
Bacciocco Auditorium, 2nd Floor
1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos CA 94070**

MINUTES OF JUNE 17, 2020

MEMBERS PRESENT: A. Brandt (Vice Chair), A. Dagum, L. Klein, P. Leung, P. Flautt, R. Valenciana, B. Shaw (Chair)

MEMBERS ABSENT: M. Romo, R. Kutler

STAFF PRESENT: D. Hansel, M. Jones, R. McCauley, J. Navarrete, J. Navarro, S. Petty, M. Salazar

Due to COVID-19, this meeting was conducted as a teleconference pursuant to the provisions of the Governor's Executive Orders N-25-20 and N-29-20, which suspends certain requirements of the Ralph M. Brown Act.

Chair Brian Shaw called the meeting to order at 5:40 p.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES OF MAY 20, 2020

Motion/Second: Klein / Leung

Ayes: Brandt, Dagum, Flautt, Valenciana, Shaw

Absent: Kutler, Romo

PUBLIC COMMENT

Public Comment received via email at cacsecretary@caltrain.com

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, I appreciate that Caltrain may consider station-to-station fares in the future, however, I am disappointed that Caltrain is choosing to wait to "study" this after completion of the Regional Fare Coordination & Integration Study. This means it could take two years before Caltrain ends the unfair and inequitable zone fare system. The current system hurts and discourages low-income riders as well as short-distance, non-traditional and off-peak riders. The extra bulky 13-mile zones make the base fare and zone fares abnormally high and discourages ridership by some potential customers. Whereas a low base fare and small incremental distance fares can bring new ridership to Caltrain.

I have recently provided a template/fare matrix spreadsheet that can be a foundation for distance-based fares to Caltrain staff, there is no reason to spend scare dollars on additional lengthy studies.

Please see attached presentation that illustrates the unfairness and inequities of the current zone fare system.

My Best Regards,
Jeff Carter

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, requested that the CAC correspondence be posted weekly as the Board does, instead of posting it once a month. He then stated that the COVID report is missing from the agenda and would have liked to have seen what is being done to ensure social distancing on the trains. He stated that making passengers feel safe riding Caltrain would help address the number one barrier to restoring ridership. Roland stated that he also agreed with the previous public comment from Jeff Carter. Lastly, Roland stated that when Caltrain begins allowing passengers to use Samtrans bus passes on Caltrain, it will mean bankruptcy for Caltrain. He stated that at that point, staff will need to separate the infrastructure, Rail, Operations and everything else and basically let another entity operate the new system that will be financially viable and that will provide service for all of the community.

Aleta Dupree, via Zoom Q&A, stated that she is interested in the possibilities of fair integration and emphasized the importance of clipper, to continue to develop clipper for Caltrain and the mobile app and work toward a Title VI analysis to move away from doing paper tickets. Aleta then asked for the committee's continued advocacy as citizens on the electrification project.

Jeff Carter Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, stated that the comments read during the public comment were specifically for item eight along with the attachment of slides that explains the visual inequity of the zone system.

CHAIRPERSON'S REPORT

Chair Brian Shaw recommended the committee and staff look up an article in The Atlantic about the safety of riding transit and the ability of the virus to be transmitted in that setting. He stated that it debunked an earlier MIT study in New York that was alluding that the virus was being transmitted by the subways. He stated that the more people understand the virus' behavior, where it transmits and what people can do when they are riding transit, which is wearing a mask and washing their hands, can really mitigate any potential issues. He also stated that the ability to socially distance on transit is going to be a challenge, particularly with Caltrain as it cannot add any more capacity. He stated passengers will probably need to get accustomed to what they are doing in higher density cities like Hong Kong, Seoul and Beijing where they wear masks, keep their hands clean and keep to themselves while they ride the train. He hopes passengers begin to understand and appreciate the realistic approach in getting people back on to Caltrain and transit system. Chair Shaw then shared that he was very pleased that Caltrain increased its service that week and that hopes more customers avail themselves to using the system.

COMMITTEE COMMENTS

Vice Chair Adrian Brandt stated that he was glad to see the 70 trains skip stop schedule that may help lure riders back, however, was surprised that Redwood City and Mountain View are not all stops station as they were with bullets. He stated that Belmont, which is virtual Hillsdale right now, and Palo Alto get all trains. He requested staff to address that matter and urged staff to make a balanced schedule, and if not, to at least to help the committee and the public understand why that is. Mr. Brandt also asked why the schedule for the skip stop train seem excessively padded and said that the end to end travel time could be tightened up a bit. He then shared his concern regarding the deferral of the one eighth cent sales tax because if it fails there may not be another opportunity and he senses a very high chance of failure, even though it's urgently needed and he urged a deferral. He then said that if, on the other hand, it fails and the authorizing legislation allows the second shot at it, then he is for it. Mr. Brandt then agreed with Chair Shaw and urged anyone interested, to Google "Atlantic COVID transit". He then requested staff to continue to investigate the use of HEPA quality filtration in the HVAC system and installation, if it's possible with the budget, of UV light systems that would kill or neutralize any micro particles that carry COVID through the air. Lastly, he shared his concern with Caltrain possibly facing major financial crises after the Cares Act funding runs out if there are no further tranches. 70% of Caltrain's operating budget came from fares and parking and up to 98% of that has disappeared. He stated that staff needs to be thinking about that and there needs to be some major creative thinking about how to keep Caltrain funded after government funding runs out.

Public Comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that the Go Passes are being extended for free for at least two months. He then stated that the complete collapse of ridership was a direct result of attempting to turn Caltrain into a Samtrans version of the VTA light rail with the same result, 100% lost ridership. He then stated that Caltrain has an opportunity to get it right. He referred the committee and staff to his letter in the correspondence packet that explains how it can be done. He then stated that regarding COVID, the UV light, is a critical part of the solution. He suggested to visit the website for further details. He also stated that the cost should be covered 100% by FEMA, the Federal Emergency Management Agency. Lastly, he stated that giving out free passes in this current crisis is beyond irresponsible and that social distancing protocols need to be observed as recommended by the CDC, the Center for Disease Control.

COVID-19: FINANCIAL IMPACTS AND RESPONSE PLANNING

Derek Hansel, Chief Financial Officer, and Sebastian Petty, Director, Caltrain Policy Dev, presented the COVID-19: Financial Impacts and Response Planning

The full Power Point presentation can be found on caltrain.com

Committee Comments:

Member Patrick Flautt thanked both Derek and Sebastian for the presentation. Member Flautt shared his thoughts and stated that currently on Caltrain's Social Media

channels the virus is talked about in general terms and recommend face coverings be worn, however Caltrain is not telling a story and not creating a perception that there is safety on Caltrain. He suggested a story be told across all social channels that starts to engender trust in the experience and the services Caltrain provides. He suggested staff to coordinate with the Social Media Officer to potentially get a program like this underway, where although Caltrain is still in the thick of things, that things are not as bad.

Vice Chair Adrian Brandt stated that he noted some references to non-labor cost savings. He then stated that he understands the Cares Act has Caltrain's hands tied but is curious about labor productivity. He stated that BART is running ten car trains to facilitate social distancing with one employee, and Caltrain, on the other hand, per the labor contract, once it adds a seventh car to a train, it automatically runs with four employees and is a glaring labor productivity disparity and asked whether staff could look at. Mr. Hansel responded that staff is aware of the issue. Mr. Brandt then asked Sebastian about his earlier comment regarding the imbalances of the 70-train schedule. Mr. Sebastian Petty responded that in general terms of putting the schedule together, it was approached in a very conservative manner and that there was a real concerted focus on, not knowing how fast ridership might come back and wanting to make sure that staff is doing everything it could to not make a particular train more attractive than the other ones. So, some of the stop patterns that might be most attractive from a rider perspective, under normal circumstances, were not the ones chosen. Mr. Petty reassured A. Brandt that it will be monitored very closely to determine how well the schedule is performing and to ensure opportunities to adjust and adapt.

Member Anna Dagum asked Derek to break down the Rail Operator Service expenses on slide 10. Mr. Hansel said that he would follow-up at a later date.

Chair Brian Shaw asked whether there is a process to scale back service or would the service need to shut down due to lack of funds, if Caltrain is unable to afford to operate come September. Mr. Hansel stated that September is when staff anticipates that the Tranche One money of the Cares Act runs out, and there will be a Tranche Two and staff is working very hard and trying to make a case for appropriate distribution to Caltrain and appropriate support to Caltrain through the Second Tranche of funding.

Member Anna Dagum asked whether staff has investigated switching to another mode of transportation while preserving the corridor, as in a rapid bus line instead of a train. Mr. Hansel stated that it has not been considered by the Board to date. He stated that simply shutting down revenue service certainly would reduce costs dramatically, but it does not eliminate those costs because Caltrain has 10 other railroads that use the line. Staff needs to understand what the implications of a variety of scenarios are and that it is not a switch.

Public Comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, asked why Derek's presentation was not posted on the website. He then stated that regarding reduction of expenses, the VTA managed to reduce monthly expenses by \$4 million back in April. He then stated that the message about restrooms, with all due respect, is unfortunate because the CDC

made a straight recommendation for members of the public to not use public restrooms, if they in any way avoid it. BART does not have that problem on trains, but they do have public restrooms in the stations. Roland then stated that contributions from the other agencies is a real problem. He stated that basically \$3 billion just disappeared so moving forward, he thinks contributions could be an issue. Lastly, Roland stated that the one eighth sales tax is dead and will not happen.

REGIONAL FARE COORDINATION AND INTEGRATION STUDY UPDATE

Melissa Jones, Principal Planner, presented the Regional Fare Coordination and Integration Study Update

The full Power Point presentation can be found on caltrain.com

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Adrian Brandt shared his concern regarding the presentation not including background research from Europe Western Europe, Germany, has been doing. He hopes staff does not reinvent the wheel and hires a consultant agency that is intimately familiar and knowledgeable about how the best practices in the world. He also noticed that SMART was not listed in the logos. Mr. Brandt then stated that in his view a switch to a far more equitable tariff instead of buying travel on Caltrain in 12.5 mile chunks and switching to a distance based system, he views that as parallel to the Regional Fare Study and can be a separate effort. He was disappointed about yet another reason to put this off, possibly for a year or two. He would like to see this move forward asap because it is long overdue and can make Caltrain more attractive and more accessible to a different rider demographic that isn't riding today because it is so cost prohibitive to step aboard. It can draw a lot more people that are either not riding transit at all or riding other transit, if the fare structure allows to pay for only what is used.

Public Comments:

Jeff Carter Millbrae, via Zoom Q&A, voiced his support of coordinating fares and believes that it is long overdue. He stated that the study needs to be done right and look at how they do it in Europe. He stated that integrated fares will bring a lot more people to transit and will bring more revenue to the transit agencies. He then stated that unfortunately transit is totally underfunded and needs to get better sources of funding for transit. He shared his disappointment that the Distance Based Fares are not given quicker consideration. He stated that he emailed the CAC inbox in the morning that included a slide presentation that demonstrates the inequities of the zone system and how it can make a distance based Caltrain better and more equitable. He then stated that he has created a fare matrix, which has been submitted to staff that can be provide that to the CAC members if they request it. Lastly, he stated that both integrated fares in the Bay Area and Distance Based on Caltrain is long overdue and needs to be done as soon as possible.

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, stated that he is glad that staff is finally starting to think about distance-based fares and is long overdue. He then stated that regarding the one eighth sales tax, people will not spend in excess of \$100M a year supporting 1300 passengers and day. Caltrain will need to restore ridership by providing a service

that is attractive to the general population and any surplus revenues is distributed to the less fortunate part of the community. Lastly he stated that London has complete integration within zones and at the end of the day, you get what you pay for.

STAFF REPORT UPDATE

Joe Navarro, Deputy Chief, Rail Operations, reported:
(The full report can be found on caltrain.com)

On-time Performance (OTP) –

- **May:** The May 2020 OTP was 95.8% compared to 95% for May 2019.
 - **Mechanical Delays –** In May 2020 there were 278 minutes of delay due to mechanical issues compared to 351 minutes in May 2019.
 - **Trespasser Strikes –** There were two trespasser strikes on May 4 and 16, both resulting in fatalities.
- **April:** The April 2020 OTP was 94.3% compared to 93.6% for April 2019
 - **Trespasser Strike –** There were two trespasser strikes on April 17, one resulting in a fatality.

(The full report can be found on caltrain.com)

Committee Comments:

Vice Chair Adrian Brandt stated that if all trains are local, with three trains per hour, the average wait time with 20-minute headways, would only be 10 minutes for random arrival at the station. So Caltrain is trading more frequent reliable service for slightly longer ride times and that might be a more successful overall schedule, serving more people. Mr. Brandt requested it be considered. Mr. Navarro responded that staff would consider and look into it. He also stated that things will change as ridership comes and that trains cannot be made so attractive to generate ridership that will not permit Caltrain to mitigate social distancing on the train. Mr. Navarro stated that staff will take everything into consideration for the next schedule change, potentially when Hillsdale station reopens.

Member Ricardo Valenciana advised that his term ends this month and that it would be his last meeting on the committee. He thanked all of the committee members and let them know that they all do an exceptional job. He thanked Brian and Adrian for all the impressive work they put in and that it is a high standard to meet. He let the committee know that he will be stepping down to allow someone else to rise to that standard and join the committee. He has been impressed with everyone's passion for the railway. He also advised Joe Navarro that it has been a real pleasure working with him every month

and that he is, by far, the most involved government employee he has ever had the pleasure to work with. He acknowledged that as an Agency representative he also has a high standard and really impressive how he gets thrown some real curveball questions from folks and is always on point and super impressed and is glad that someone like Joe Navarro is representing the JPB, especially during this extremely challenging time for the railway. He reiterated to everyone that they are all in the best hands possible with the committee, the agency and the community. He stated that he looks forward to hopefully coming back someday and being able to help again.

Public comments:

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, via Zoom Q&A, respectfully stated that Mr. Joe Navarro is being really thoughtful with how to approach this and asked not to criticize staff and to allow this plan to play out. He stated the Mr. Navarro made it very clear that moving forward, staff will be looking at what's happening, and will be flexible. Roland then stated that people are commuting and not staying at home and is why the freeways are going red again. On Google Maps if customers flip back and forth between driving and transit, it is a solid hour faster to drive and passengers will not come back until that is resolved. Lastly, Roland stated that the Stadler trains are two years late.

Doug DeLong, via Zoom Q&A, asked about something in the capital project report that was delivered at the last Board Meeting, that was an unusual situation. He stated that the 25th Avenue grade separation project showed a red traffic signal for safety and it mentioned that there were four reportable incidents during a month. He stated that he does not recall another project having a red traffic signal for safety. He asked whether there was any information that could be shared. Mr. Navarro advised that he would look into it and follow-up at a later date.

JPB CAC Work Plan

July 15, 2020

- Industry Safe Functionality
- Mobile Parking App / TVM's

August 19, 2020

- FY 2021 JPB Preliminary Operating & Capital Budgets
- Brown Act Training
- COVID-19 Productivity Report

September 16, 2020

- Rail Safety Education / Suicide Prevention Efforts
-

October 21, 2020

-
-

November 18, 2020

-
-

December 16, 2020

-
-

Items to be scheduled

- Schedule Audit – requested by Member Lauren Fernandez on 3/6/18
- Go Pass cost per ride factors – requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 6/19/19
- San Mateo County Climate Action Plan – requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 10/16/19
- MTC Means-Based Discount Fare program update
- Caltrain connections with other agencies – requested by Member Rosalind Kutler on 12/18/19
- Update on grade crossing pilot six months after installation – requested by Member, Patrick Flautt on 12/18/19
- Summary video of the CAC meetings by the Social Media Officer – requested by Chair, Brian Shaw on 12/18/19
- Grade Crossing Improvements to be scheduled for a future meeting
- Operating Costs – requested by Member Adrian Brandt on 2/13/20

DATE, TIME AND LOCATION OF NEXT REGULAR MEETING:

July 15, 2020 at 5:40 p.m., San Mateo County Transit District Administrative Building,
2nd Floor Bacciocco Auditorium, 1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos, CA.

Adjourned at 7:29 pm