Chair Adrienne Tissier called the meeting to order at 10:02 a.m. and led the Pledge of Allegiance.

**PUBLIC HEARING FOR PROPOSED CHANGES TO THE CODIFIED TARIFF (PROPOSED FARE AND PARKING CHANGES)**

Martha Martinez, Executive Officer, District Secretary/Executive Administration, reported on the steps taken to announce and receive public comment after the Board called for today’s public hearing at the September 3 meeting.

Ms. Martinez said public meetings were held on October 10 in Gilroy with three attendees, October 17 in San Carlos with no attendees, October 15 in San Francisco with 11 attendees, and October 19 in Mountain View with five attendees. A summary of comments received will be provided at the December meeting.

Director Ken Yeager arrived 10:04

Seamus Murphy, Chief Communications Officer, presented:

- **Objective**
  - Generate revenue to support increased operating and maintenance needs
  - Support strategic plan focus area
    - Establish financial stability, minimize operating subsidy, and fund system improvements
    - Develop strategies to increase returns from existing revenue streams

- **Proposal**
  - Increase base fare by 50 cents
    - From $3.25 to $3.75
    - Corresponding increase for Day Pass, 8-ride Ticket and Monthly Pass
  - Maintain 15 percent Clipper discount
  - Maintain 50 percent Eligible Discount fare
  - Increase parking fees
    - 50-cent increase in Daily Parking (from $5 to $5.50)
    - $5 increase in Monthly Parking fee (from $50 to $55)
Director Malia Cohen arrived at 10:06 a.m.

- Fare History
  - 2011: Base fare increased from $2.50 to $2.75
  - 2012: Base fare for paper tickets increased to $3; Clipper base fare remained at $2.75
  - 2014: Base fare for paper tickets increased to $3.25; Clipper base fare remained at $2.75

- Parking Fee History
  - 2011: Daily fees increased from $3 to $4; monthly fees increased from $30 to $40
  - 2013: Daily fees increased from $4 to $5; monthly fees increased from $40 to $50

- Fare Comparison to Nine Other Rail Transit Agencies
  - Per mile
    - Caltrain today is at the average for the cash fare, with increases would be one cent above the average
  - One-way cash fare
    - Caltrain is 31 cents below the average today, would be 19 cents above the average with the increase
    - Maximum travel for all zones, with increases Caltrain would be below the average, with the Gilroy extension Caltrain would be above the average
  - Monthly Pass
    - Today and with increase Caltrain is below the average

- Ridership has increased 2.1 times since Fiscal Year (FY) 2004
- Farebox revenues have increased 4.03 times since FY2004
- Farebox recovery ratios have increased 30 percent since FY2008

- Operating Costs
  - Increased due to aging fleet, which leads to increased maintenance, and increased demand for special service
  - New costs projected for the Communications-based Overlay Signal System (CBOSS)/Positive Train Control (PTC) and electrification projects and Electric Multiple Unit (EMU) procurement

- Operating expenses continue to increase
- Operations and maintenance is forecasted to increase

- New Revenues
  - 50-cent base fare increase = $7.9 million
  - Parking fee increase = $400,000

- Outreach
  - Community meetings
  - Presentation to Citizens Advisory Committee (CAC)
  - Public hearing
  - Social media
  - Website
  - Newspaper notices
  - News release
  - Onboard flyers
Visual messages at stations
35 comments received

Director Jose Cisneros said the Monthly Pass is below the average for comparable systems and asked if staff has considered raising the price. Mr. Murphy said the price is built into a multiplier, which is 26.5. Other agencies use a larger multiplier and have different policies that allow a higher cost monthly pass. The Caltrain monthly pass is only available through Clipper, which presents challenges. This suggestion could merit more consideration in the future.

Director Cisneros asked how many riders use the monthly pass. Christiane Kwok, Manager, Market Research and Development, said 40 percent.

Director Cisneros said the people who use the monthly pass are probably less sensitive to price increases, but they are getting a break, which does not make sense.

Public Comment
Jeff Carter, Millbrae, said the lowest price monthly pass is $73, but slide 6 shows it to be $36.50. The average monthly pass is about $150. He said Caltrain should reconsider the zone system because zones are inequitable. A person who rides two miles will pay the same as a person who rides 20 miles in the same zone. Caltrain should go to station-to-station pricing. The typical fare for a Caltrain rider in FY2015 is $4.52 per ride, but Metra riders in Chicago pay $3.76 per ride, and Bay Area Rapid Transfer (BART) riders pay $3.73 per trip. Caltrain riders pay higher fares, and this is not including parking or bus access to Caltrain.

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, said Go Pass users are from high technology companies and pay $190 per year and they make around $200,000 a year. He said he is unemployed and pays $190 a month for Clipper. He said the farebox revenue has gone up 25 percent in the last two years, and the reason for flat farebox recovery is because costs are out of control and are growing faster than hours of service provided. The San Mateo County Transit District (District) just got $1.5 million purely for salaries and benefit increases. He said the JPB should terminate the administration agreement with the District, or the JPB should turn over Caltrain to the private sector.

Doug DeLong, Mountain View, said the discrepancy with the monthly pass figures are actually the discounted monthly pass figures. He said there used to be a policy that all fares were rounded to nearest quarter, but that will be eliminated because Clipper fares are not multiples of 25 cents. He supports increasing fares and farebox recovery. The service might be underpriced. He would like to see a low-income discount.

Andrew Boone, East Palo Alto, said he tries to avoid the train because of the cost and because it is unreliable. The cost to San Francisco and back is $18. Just because the median income is over $100,000 doesn’t mean everyone can afford the train. Bicycling is dangerous and the bus is not a practical mode of transportation because it is slow. Increasing prices should be the last thing for increasing revenues. Charging so little for the Go Pass and so much for other users is discriminatory. Companies can afford price increases.
Andy Chow, Redwood City, said he is concerned about the amount of fare increases. It should be a two-phase increase similar to SamTrans. Even though the Caltrain fare is high, Caltrain is still patronized by low-income people to get to work.

Adina Levin, Friends of Caltrain, said the Go Pass is a place to look at to increase fares, and the JPB should look at populations that are priced out of Caltrain today and look at providing a Go Pass for locations with low-income people working there. The JPB should also look at integrating fares with BART.

Mr. Murphy said there is an error on the Fare Comparison slide for the monthly pass. The number used reflects the eligible discount, which is 50 percent of the base fare. Even by doubling the number in the chart, Caltrain is still below the average by $20 today and with the fare increase it would be below the average cost.

Chair Tissier asked if staff could look at the feasibility of a low-income discount.

Director Rose Guilbault asked how the Go Pass amount was decided and if it is a problem to raise it. Mr. Murphy said the amount is based on a three zone average trip length estimated usage for customers who would use the Go Pass. The Go Pass cost increases over time have been based on the base fare increase. Since 2011 the base fare and Go Pass have been 25 to 30 percent. The Board approved an increase to the Go Pass that will go into effect in January and the cost will go up to $190.

Director Guilbault asked if there is a possibility to raise it. Mr. Murphy said staff has heard the Go Pass is underpriced. This proposal does not include an increase, so as a part of this action staff wouldn’t be able to add it on. It is worth exploring.

Director Tom Nolan said he agrees looking at low-income fares. In San Francisco it is free for low-income students, seniors, and people with disabilities. Some version of that would reflect a need in this area. Mr. Murphy said the Metropolitan Transportation Commission (MTC) is conducting a study that will wrap up in the spring that is looking at options for equity-based fares. Staff will review the findings when they are available.

Director Nolan asked for a report of the MTC study.

Jim Hartnett, Executive Director, said when companies enter the Go Pass contract, they pay a fee based on the total number of employees they have whether or not the employees ride Caltrain. What it costs per employee is not representative of the employees riding. Part of the philosophy of the program is the company is encouraging employees to take public transit. Whether or not the employees use the Go Pass, the company still has to pay the JPB. It is difficult on a per-ticket basis to say how much it costs per rider. Caltrain will be conducting a comprehensive review of the fare structure and will return to the Board with further thoughts on a long-term ongoing fare structure.

Director Jeff Gee asked if it is too late to implement this in two phases. Joan Cassman, Legal Counsel, said no, a phase-in could be considered. The current tariff calls for a 50 percent discount for seniors, disabled, youth, and Medicare cardholders.
Director Malia Cohen asked what the rationale is for phasing in the increase. Director Gee said a gradual increase is less shocking to the system and the customers than doing it all at once. People get used to having no fare increases for so long, then a large increase at once is shocking. He would rather raise fares a little every year than a chunk every few years.

Ms. Cassman said the Board heard a comprehensive review of the fare proposals, the proposals were presented to the public for comment, the Board offered the public opportunities to comment orally and in writing, and the Board has met all applicable procedural requires and may close the hearing.

Motion to close the public hearing.
Motion/Second: Nolan/Guilbault
Ayes: Cisneros, Cohen, Gee, Guilbault, Kalra, Nolan, Woodward, Yeager, Tissier

Chair Tissier said this item will be brought back to the Board at the December 3 meeting for action.

PUBLIC COMMENT
Roland Lebrun, San Jose, said after the new government came into the United Kingdom (UK) last July, they fired the chairman of the board for the electrification project because the cost went up by a factor of three and there would be a four-year delay. He said the UK should not have done the re-signaling before starting electrification because the pylons installed for electrification cut through the fiber optic cables. They will be using some bi-mode trains, which can run whether the line is electrified or not, and some trains that are purely electric and need an electrified line.

Jeff Carter, Millbrae, said Caltrain runs an inadequate Saturday schedule on Black Friday while other systems run regular schedules. People trying to connect from BART or SamTrans have trouble connecting to Caltrain. Caltrain should at least run a modified schedule to provide sufficient service to people who work on that day.

Andrew Boone, East Palo Alto, said the last train northbound from San Jose and south from San Francisco is 90 minutes apart. He said people can go out at night in San Francisco but not in Sunnyvale or San Jose. There are more special event trains serving San Francisco than San Jose. It looks like Caltrain does not consider special event trains for San Jose, which has a big downtown and has a lot of people.

Adina Levin, Friends of Caltrain, said the San Mateo County Transportation Authority is considering a bike overcrossing at the Holly Street/Highway 101 interchange in San Carlos. The JPB should support this as part of the Caltrain last-mile system.

CONSENT CALENDAR
a) Approval of Minutes of October 1, 2015
b) Approval of 2016 Board Meeting Calendar
c) Acceptance of Statement of Revenues and Expenses for September 2015
Motion/Second: Nolan/Cisneros
Ayes: Cisneros, Cohen, Gee, Guilbault, Kalra, Nolan, Woodward, Yeager, Tissier

CHAIRPERSON’S REPORT
Resolution of Appreciation for Outgoing Director Ash Kalra
Chair Tissier presented a resolution of appreciation to Director Kalra.

Motion/Second: Nolan/Gee
Ayes: Cisneros, Cohen, Gee, Guilbault, Kalra, Nolan, Woodward, Yeager, Tissier

Director Kalra thanked the Board, staff, and public for helping inform his opinion on Caltrain, which he said is one of the most significant backbones to the transportation system and economy of the Bay Area.

REPORT OF THE CAC
Adina Levin, CAC Member, said at its October 21 meeting, the CAC:
- Received an update from the subcommittee that is working to improve train signage at platforms
- Discussed how Caltrain’s schedules will be adjusted to reflect the reality of the increased ridership
- Proposed staff look into adding service to accommodate demand

Public Comment
Roland Lebrun, San Jose, said staff had agreed to increase the lengths of the Gallery cars. Trains are very crowded.

REPORT OF THE EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR
Caltrain Modernization (CalMod) Update
Dave Couch, Director, Project Delivery, presented:
- Project Delivery Efforts
  - Environmental consultation and permits
    - Staff has had conversations with the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) about the environmental process and has worked through the issues
    - Staff is waiting for the last administrative letter that is needed, and then will be able to complete the process
    - There is ongoing coordination for remaining permits
  - Federal oversight: The FTA has assigned a project management oversight contractor to monitor the program
  - City/county agreements
    - Millbrae approved
    - Other cities/counties to be approved
  - Real estate
    - Santa Clara County properties appraisal complete
    - November closed session for property acquisitions
    - Other segments to follow
  - Pacific Gas and Electric
    - Power study complete
    - Scoping and design started
Utilities
- Potholing in progress for critical locations
- Coordinating relocation of utilities crossing the right of way

Central Equipment Maintenance and Operation Facility
- Completed conceptual design
- Coordination of final design pending EMU selection

Tunnel
- Design review of 65 percent design completed
- Coordination of design with California High-speed Rail Authority (CHSRA) and Union Pacific Railroad underway

Marian Lee, Chief Officer, Caltrain Planning/CalMod Program, presented:

- Funding Update
  - Bay Area Air Quality Management District $20 million approved
  - FTA Core Capacity
    - Approved for project development phase
    - Package submitted for project rating and inclusion in presidential budget
    - Request for engineering phase to be done
  - Finalizing Six-party Supplemental Memorandum of Understanding
  - Working with CHSRA on funding agreements and Proposition 1A submittals

- Electrification Infrastructure
  - Confidential information, transparent process
  - Complete
    - Proposals received from four of six prequalified proposers
    - Technical evaluation complete
    - Partner participation included several local agencies
  - To do
    - Best and final offer with shortlisted bidders
    - Complicated considerations on active railroad with three proposers
    - Revised contract award date (summer to fall 2016)

- EMU
  - Complete
    - Six to seven vendors participated in the request for information and high boarding discussion
    - Request for proposals issued in August
    - Pre-proposal conference with five car builders
  - To do
    - Bid submittal due December
    - Number of proposals to be determined
    - Revised contract award date to be determined

Chair Tissier said it is important to get the six-party agreement done because when the agency goes to Washington, D.C. it will be difficult to get the Core Capacity grant without being able to show full support from the region. She encouraged the JPB partners to get it done in the next month or so.

Director Cohen asked what the project delay will do to the overall schedule. Ms. Lee said the six- to nine-month delay does not equate to a six- to nine-month delay in
Joint Powers Board Meeting
Minutes of November 5, 2015

revenue service. All bidders have proposed a different sequence of events and construction schedules, and once discussions have begun with them, staff will understand the implications. Some information shows the delay might move out revenue service and some information shows it might not. The Best and Final Offer process needs to be completed before the schedule is understood.

Director Gee said all proposers know what the revenue service date is and it is up to them to work backwards on needs and methods to achieve that. The Board won’t know until the final proposer is identified how the proposer is going to achieve it. This is an active railroad and construction needs to take place without disrupting service too much while keeping it safe.

Michelle Bouchard, Chief Operating Officer, Rail, said staff has taken steps to analyze and assess the weaknesses and breakdowns that occurred during the train strike that occurred at Broadway Avenue in Burlingame on September 25. Staff formed a multidisciplinary group between the JPB and Transit America Services, Inc. in order to address individual items that were identified. Three broad areas were identified: communications, training and familiarization, and standard operational procedures. There are nine action items that will lead staff to establish new communications and operating procedures. A substantial amount of work is underway. Staff will be assessing that the newly established standards are being followed by changing the debrief process to provide more meaningful information, conducting field audit testing of personnel and their knowledge of procedures, and conducting training drills.

Director Gee asked if the fire chief is going to be the incident commander. Ms. Bouchard said typically when an incident occurs the conductor takes the role because that is the first person on the scene. It is transferred to the Transit Police when they arrive, and usually ends up being fire chief.

Mark Simon, Senior Advisor, Strategic Initiatives, said District staff have heard from many major private employers who are concerned about the impact congestion on U.S. Highway 101 is having on their ability to recruit and retain employees. Several years ago a rail corridor was proposed across the Dumbarton Bridge. Staff did not proceed with the proposal because there was no major funding path. An environmental impact report was started but never concluded because in order to get it certified by the Federal government, it must have a funding plan. Some private employers have asked if something can be done to activate the corridor. Staff will conduct a study of the entire corridor, not just whether the rail bridge can be activated and sources of funding can be identified, but also if there are additional transit options on the western side including bus and light rail. An informal agreement was concluded last week with Facebook, who will be providing $1 million to undertake the study. A funding agreement is expected soon. Facebook recognizes that anything done must serve the larger community.

Mr. Hartnett said the primary reason Caltrain does not meet its on-time performance (OTP) statistics, aside from when there are incidents on the railroad, is because of the large number of passengers and bikes. It takes more time to get people off and on the train. Staff wants people to have realistic expectations about when trains will arrive and depart, so staff is looking at making schedule adjustments.
Mr. Hartnett reported

- **Special Service**
  - An estimated extra 630 rides were provided for San Francisco Giants games during the course of the year.
  - Caltrain is providing service to San Francisco 49ers games at Levi's Stadium.
  - Additional service was provided for Stanford events.
  - Additional service was provided for the San Jose Sharks.
  - About 14,000 additional rides were provided for San Francisco Fleet Week.
  - A Sunday service will be provided on Thanksgiving Day.
  - The Holiday Train is coming up.

- **Ongoing Projects**
  - San Mateo bridges replacement projects
  - San Francisco bridges
  - Los Gatos Bridge replacement
  - Santa Clara Valley Transportation Authority light rail efficiency project

**Public Comment**

Roland Lebrun, San Jose, said the busiest rail line in Europe is running four tracks and four trains an hour. One track is shut down for 10 miles to work on electrifying that section. People who know how to do this can. Caltrain was supposed to electrify by 2012. The fleet was supposed to be replaced between 2012 and 2015. The Short-range Transit Plans states 20 of the 29 locomotives are shot, and 60 percent of the rolling stock is done. CHSRA funding is in jeopardy. A "Plan B" needs to be come up with to replace the rolling stock whether electrification happens or not.

Adina Levin, Friends of Caltrain, said she is on the Menlo Park Transportation General Plan Committee and there is support there for development related to connecting with the growth in Redwood City by the Dumbarton corridor.

**UPDATE ON CBOSS/PTC PROJECT**

Mr. Murphy said Congress approved a three-year blanket extension for the PTC mandate. Systems are not required to have PTC implemented on their corridors until 2018. Caltrain is still moving as quickly as possible.

Gigi Harrington, Deputy CEO, presented:

- Caltrain is making good progress on system testing.
- The Federal Railroad Administration has been discussing whether they want Caltrain to include additional enhancements. This is slowing the testing.
- Caltrain is targeting to submit the revenue service demonstration application early in 2016 and be in revenue service demonstration 90 days later with a system accepted by the end of June.
- The project is currently on budget.
- Caltrain has completed mitigation activities, improved delivery dates, increased productivity, increased the number of technical resources, increased access to the railroad, and is working on the safety plan development.
- Interoperability testing with one of the tenants will be conducted in the first quarter of 2016.
Public Comment
Roland Lebrun, San Jose, said staff should take this opportunity to replace “ITCS” with “ETCS,” which is what Union Pacific is using and will solve all the compatibility problems. The JPB could also do the re-signaling at the same time, which will make it so trains will stop automatically when a bus or car is on the tracks. This will lead to a much faster and seamless electrification system.

KEY CALTRAIN PERFORMANCE STATISTICS – SEPTEMBER 2015
Ms. Bouchard said:
- Key Caltrain Performance Statistics September 2015 compared to September 2014
  - Total Ridership was 1,640,888, an increase of 4.2 percent.
  - OTP was 86.2 percent, a decrease of 5 percent.
- Year-to-Date Performance Statistics
  - Total Ridership was 5,049,358, an increase of 5.2 percent.
  - OTP was 86 percent, a decrease of 6.7 percent.
- In order to come up with a rationalized timetable with a higher level of reliability, staff needs to ride trains and collect data on dwell times. The timetable is very convoluted and many of the trains are dependent on each other because of the overtakes. Adjustments need to be vetted through modeling. Staff will return in December to provide an update as to when a timetable proposal will be available.
- Staff is heavily involved in Super Bowl planning.
- A Saturday service will be operated on Black Friday. Counts will be taken to ensure an appropriate level of service is being provided.
- A bus bridge service will be provided between Hayward Park, San Mateo, and Burlingame on November 7 due to the Tilton Avenue Bridge change out.
- The Holiday Train will run on December 5 and 6.
- Between September 25 and October 7 there were three individual car strike incidents, two at the Broadway crossing and one at the Bayswater crossing in Burlingame. As soon as the incident on 25th occurred, staff from the Public Utilities Commission (PUC), Transit Police, and the city of Burlingame were brought together to look at what could be happening at these crossings. An appropriate action plan was developed based on what was observed. Burlingame police started doing targeted enforcement two to three times per week. Prominent “keep clear” pavement markings will be installed at Broadway Avenue, which required PUC approval, and the city of Burlingame will install larger “keep off the track” signs. Staff will continue the enforcement and education campaign. Staff assessed the Bayswater crossing and decided the pavement markings could be cleaned up and maintained.

Public Comment
Roland Lebrun, San Jose, said the JPB should put cameras in front of the doors and record boardings to understand dwell times. He asked how modifications to the U.S. Highway 101/Broadway interchange were authorized before Broadway was grade separated. This is why there are vehicle strikes at that intersection.

Director Perry Woodward left at 11:50 a.m.
AUTHORIZE GRANTING AN EASEMENT TO PACIFIC GAS AND ELECTRIC COMPANY TO ACCOMMODATE THE QUINT STREET BRIDGE REPLACEMENT PROJECT
No discussion.

Motion/Second: Nolan/Kalra
Ayes: Cisneros, Cohen, Gee, Guilbault, Kalra, Nolan, Yeager, Tissier
Absent: Woodward

AUTHORIZE ENTERING INTO AN AGREEMENT WITH THE SAN FRANCISCO MUNICIPAL TRANSPORTATION AGENCY TO RECEIVE $39 MILLION FOR THE COMMUNICATIONS-BASED OVERLAY SIGNAL SYSTEM POSITIVE TRAIN CONTROL PROJECT AND PENINSULA CORRIDOR ELECTRIFICATION PROJECT
No discussion.

Motion/Second: Nolan/Kalra
Ayes: Cisneros, Cohen, Gee, Guilbault, Kalra, Nolan, Yeager, Tissier
Absent: Woodward

Director Woodward returned at 11:51 a.m.

AUTHORIZE AWARD OF CONTRACTS TO PROVIDE ON-CALL REAL ESTATE SUPPORT SERVICES FOR A NOT-TO-EXCEED AMOUNT OF $2,150,000 FOR A SIX-YEAR TERM
No discussion.

Motion/Second: Nolan/Guilbault
Ayes: Cisneros, Cohen, Gee, Guilbault, Kalra, Nolan, Woodward, Yeager, Tissier

LEGISLATIVE UPDATE
Shweta Bhatnagar, Government Affairs Officer, said the House passed a six-year surface transportation authorization. The Senate previously passed their version of the bill. The House and Senate authorization committees will meet next week to iron out any differences in the bills.

CORRESPONDENCE
No discussion.

BOARD MEMBER REQUESTS
None.

DATE/TIME/PLACE OF NEXT REGULAR MEETING
The next meeting will be Thursday, December 3, 2015, 10 a.m. at San Mateo County Transit District Administrative Building, Bacciocco Auditorium, 2nd Floor, 1250 San Carlos Avenue, San Carlos, CA 94070.

GENERAL COUNSEL REPORT
Recessed to closed session at 11:53 a.m.

Directors Cohen and Kalra left at 12:00 p.m.
Reconvened at 12:07 p.m.

Ms. Cassman said the Board met in closed session and no action was taken on this item.

Conference with Real Property Negotiators (JPB Real Estate Staff and General Counsel) pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.8:
Ms. Cassman said the Board has given authorization to the executive director to move forward with the acquisition of the property interests listed in the agenda and the delegation of authority reflected in the resolution that is presented to the Board.

Authorize the Approval of Certain Real Estate Offers and Transactions in Santa Clara County for the Peninsula Corridor Electrification Project and Approve Associated Property Acquisition Expenses
Motion second: Nolan/Woodward
Ayes: Cisneros, Gee, Guilbault, Nolan, Woodward, Yeager, Tissier
Absent: Cohen, Kalra

Adjourned at 12:09 p.m.